

Annex 1

Meeting	Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Date	11 March 2013
Subject	Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group – Final Report
Report of	Scrutiny Office
Summary of Report	This report encloses at Appendix 1 the final report of the Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group following their review of the costs and benefits of the reintroduction of cash meters within Barnet. The Committee are requested to consider the findings and recommendations of the Task and Finish Group as set out in the report

Officer Contributors	Anita Vukomanovic Overview and Scrutiny Officer
Status (public or exempt)	Public
Wards Affected	All
Key Decision	N/A
Reason for urgency / exemption from call-in	N/A
Function of	Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Enclosures	Appendix 1 – Report of the Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group Annexe 1 – Written Submissions to Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group
Contact for Further Information:	Anita Vukomanovic, Overview and Scrutiny Officer ☎ 020 8359 7034 anita.vukomanovic@barnet.gov.uk

1. RECOMMENDATION

- 1.1 The Committee to consider the findings and recommendations of the Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group, as set out in the report attached at Appendix 1.**
- 1.2 The Committee endorse the report for onward referral to the next Cabinet meeting with any recommendations (if appropriate).**

2. RELEVANT PREVIOUS DECISIONS

- 2.1 Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, 7 October 2013, [Members Item – Parking Policy](#) – the Committee received a Member's Item in the name of Cllr. Schneiderman calling for a review into the benefits of reintroducing cash metres into Barnet High Streets.
- 2.2 Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, 6 January 2014: [Parking Policy Task and Finish Group](#) – the Committee reviewed the decision to undertake a review of Parking Policy (Cash Meters) as set out in the Members' Item in the name of Cllr. Schneiderman in light of the on-going internal parking review and resolved that the Task and Finish Group on Parking Policy (Cash Meters) proceed as agreed in October 2013.

3. CORPORATE PRIORITIES AND POLICY CONSIDERATIONS

- 3.1 The Overview and Scrutiny Committees must ensure that the work of Scrutiny is reflective of the Council's priorities.
- 3.2 The three priority outcomes set out in the 2013 – 2016 Corporate Plan are: –
 - Promote responsible growth, development and success across the borough.
 - Support families and individuals that need it – promoting independence, learning and well-being.
 - Improve the satisfaction of residents and businesses with the London Borough of Barnet as a place to live, work and study.
- 3.3 In relation to the **Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group**, the following strategic objectives, outcomes and targets are relevant to the work of the Group:

“Improve the satisfaction of residents and businesses within the London Borough of Barnet as a place to live, work and study”

“To maintain the right environment for a strong and diverse local economy”

“Increase usage of paid for parking bays and car parks in town centres”

4. RISK MANAGEMENT ISSUES

- 4.1 The Overview and Scrutiny Procedure Rules allow Members to refer issues (relevant to the functions of a committee) to a committee for consideration. In this case, Councillor Schneiderman proposed the establishment of this Task

and Finish Group at a meeting of the Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 7 October 2013 and the request was duly agreed. Following an update on an internal parking review, received at the Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 6 January 2014, the Committee reaffirmed their intention to commission the review. In accordance with this request, the review has now been completed.

- 4.2 Failure to address issues of local interest or public concern through the overview and scrutiny process may result in reputational damage to the Council.

5. EQUALITIES AND DIVERSITY ISSUES

- 5.1 Pursuant to the Equality Act 2010 (“the Act”), the council, in the exercise of its functions, has to have ‘due regard’ to: (i) eliminating unlawful discrimination, harassment, victimisation and any other conduct that is prohibited by or under the Act; (ii) advancing equality of opportunity between those with a relevant protected characteristic and those without; and (iii) fostering good relations between those with a relevant protected characteristics and those without. The relevant protected characteristics are age, race, disability, gender reassignment, pregnancy, and maternity, religion or belief, sex and sexual orientation. The ‘protected characteristics’ also include marriage. The duty also covers civil partnership, but to a limited extent.
- 5.2 In addition to the Terms of Reference of the Committee, and in so far as relating to matters within its remit, the role of the Committee is to perform the Overview and Scrutiny role in relation to:
- The Council’s leadership role in relation to diversity and inclusiveness; and
 - The fulfilment of the Council’s duties as employer including recruitment and retention, personnel, pensions and payroll services, staff development, equalities and health and safety.
- 5.3 Task and Finish Groups take into account equalities considerations throughout the lifecycle of the review. In addition, Overview and Scrutiny Committees should give due regard to equalities considerations when undertaking the on-going monitoring of recommendations made by Task and Finish Groups which have been accepted by Cabinet and are being implemented.
- 5.4 As noted in the Final Report of the Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group, in August 2011, a decision was made by Delegated Powers Report, 1375: *Re-Provision of Parking Services* about the removal of pay and display parking machines and implementation of a policy of ‘cashless’ parking across the borough. To support that decision making process an Equalities Impact Assessment on the removal of pay and display parking machines was undertaken. This Equalities Impact Assessment considered the pSotential impacts and considered possible ways to mitigate these.

6. USE OF RESOURCES IMPLICATIONS (Finance, Procurement, Performance & Value for Money, Staffing, IT, Property, Sustainability)

- 6.1 Task and Finish Group reviews have the ability to undertake investigations into specific issues to explore how well the Council is managing and using its resources to deliver value for money and better and more sustainable outcomes for local people.
- 6.2 In undertaking their investigations, Task and Finish Groups must take into account the costs and potential benefits (both financial and non-financial) associated with any recommendations they are making.
- 6.3 In the case of the Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group review, a detailed breakdown of the financial implications arising from the recommendations are set out in Sections 3.19 – 3.21 of the Task and Finish Group report. In summary, the following costs are associated with implementing the Labour Group’s recommendation 1 (*That Cabinet be recommended to bring back cash parking with immediate effect by converting the recently introduced credit/debit card pay and display meters (59 machines in total borough-wide) to accept cash payment.*)
- Cost of modifying 59 pay and display machines to accept cash payments: approximately £20,000
 - Additional annual costs (approximate) of Converting 59 Pay and Display Machines to Accept Cash:

Figure 1: Cost of Converting 59 Pay and Display Machines to Accept Cash (x2 Weekly Collections)

Credit / Debit Card and Coin Machine	Cost
Additional Annual Maintenance Cost (£229 x 59)	£13,511
Annual machine replacement allowance	£8,300
Coin collection costs	£92,040
Signage Cost – 1 st Year Capital	£6,000
Signs maintenance	£600
Ticket Rolls, including replacement	£32,000
Total Cost	£143,551 per annum

Figure 2: Cost of Converting 59 Pay and Display Machines to Accept Cash (x5 Weekly Collections)

Credit / Debit Card and Coin Machine	Cost
Additional Annual Maintenance Cost (£229 x 59)	£13,511
Annual machine replacement allowance	£8,300
Coin collection costs	£199,420
Signage Cost – 1 st Year Capital	£6,000
Signs maintenance	£600
Ticket Rolls, including replacement	£32,000
Total Cost	£259,831 per annum

Assumptions:

Additional Annual Maintenance Cost

Annual maintenance cost for existing credit/debit card machines = £382

Annual maintenance cost for credit/debit card and cash machines = £611

Additional annual maintenance cost as a result of enabling existing credit/debit card machines to accept cash payments = £229

X2 Weekly Collections

Assumes a transaction ratio of 20% cash and 80% Pay By Phone. Therefore the cost of Pay By Phone would reduce from current cost (£360,000) to £288,000.

X2 weekly collection regime would result in a higher 'per collection' unit cost. Coin collection costs are calculated on the following basis: £15 per collection x 59 machines x 2 weekly x 52 weeks = £92,040

X5 Weekly Collections

Assumes a transaction ratio of 50% cash and 50% Pay By Phone. Cost of Pay By Phone would reduce from current cost (£360,000) to £180,000.

X5 weekly collection regime would result in the following unit cost. Coin collection costs are calculated on the following basis: £13 per collection x 59 machines x 5 weekly x 52 weeks = £199,420

6.5 It is assumed that Pay By Phone would be retained in any circumstance as this currently the primary payment method for parking in the Borough. It is recognised that the re-introduction of cash as a payment method will have an impact on income from Pay By Phone transactions. Accordingly, estimates have been made on the reduction on income from this source as follows:

- Under Figure 1, the estimated reduction in Pay By Phone costs would be £72,000.
- Under Figure 2, the estimated reduction on Pay By Phone costs would be £180,000.

It is not possible to make assumptions around the take-up of cash payments and the subsequent level of income from this payment type. It should be acknowledged that there is a risk that the Council could incur costs from re-introducing cash as a payment method, but with a low take-up following reintroduction.

6.6 The costs associated with administering the Task and Finish Group review have been met from existing resources within the Governance Service budget. Lead Commissioners and Delivery Units have provided officer support for the review process.

6.7 The implementation of recommendations being made by the Task and Finish Group will need to be met from existing delivery unit budgets.

7. LEGAL ISSUES

7.1 Under Section 21 of the Local Government Act 2000, the Council's executive arrangements are required to include provision for appointment of an Overview and Scrutiny Committee with specified powers, including the power to make reports or recommendations to the authority or the executive with respect to the discharge of any functions which are the responsibility of the executive.

8. CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS (Relevant section from the Constitution, Key/Non-Key Decision)

- 8.1 The scope of the Overview and Scrutiny Committees is contained within Part 2, Article 6 of the Council's Constitution.
- 8.2 The Terms of Reference of the Scrutiny Committees are included in the Overview and Scrutiny Procedure Rules (Part 4 of the Council's Constitution). The Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee has within its terms of reference responsibility:
- i) To have overall responsibility for monitoring and coordinating overview and scrutiny work across the authority.
 - ii) To appoint scrutiny panels and task and finish groups needed to facilitate the overview and scrutiny function.
 - iii) To coordinate and monitor the work of scrutiny panels and task and finish groups, including considering reports and recommendations and referring to the relevant decision-making body

9. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

- 9.1 At a meeting of the Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 7 October 2013, a Member's Item was received from Cllr. Schneiderman calling for a review into the benefits of reintroducing cash metres into High Streets in the Borough. The Members item explicitly stated that the review should take evidence from residents, traders and local businesses, and other Councils where cash meters have been maintained and removed.
- 9.2 At their meeting on 6 January 2014, the Business Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered a report which sought a decision regarding whether the Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group review should proceed, taking into account the current projected timetable for the internal Parking Improvement Project which included the development of a borough-wide parking policy.
- 9.3 At this meeting, the Housing & Environment Lead Commissioner outlined the scope and timetable for the internal Parking Improvement Project and clarified that payment methods were not currently in scope for the Project.
- 9.4 Following consideration of the report, the Committee instructed that the proposed Parking Policy (Cash Meters) Task and Finish Group review should proceed (as per the decision of the committee on 7 October 2013) and would be focused on the costs and benefits of reintroducing cash meters in high streets and car parks, not the wider parking policy of the Council. The Committee resolved that the Task and Finish Group should proceed with the following scope:

"To review the costs and benefits of reintroducing cash meters in Barnet high streets and car parks, with the review to take evidence from residents, traders and local businesses, and other Councils where cash meters have been maintained and removed."

9.5 The Members appointed to this Task and Finish Group were:

Councillor Brian Gordon
Councillor Joan Scannell
Councillor Hugh Rayner
Councillor Ross Houston
Councillor Alan Schneiderman

The substitute Members were:

Councillor Maureen Braun
Councillor Pauline Coakley Webb
Councillor Claire Farrier

9.6 A Final meeting of the Task and Finish Group took place on 13 February at which the Group concluded their findings and agreed the recommendations as set out in the report at **Appendix 1**.

10. LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

10.1 None.

Cleared by Finance (Officer's initials)	JH/AD
Cleared by Legal (Officer's initials)	PM